OPINION ARTICLE



REVISED Soil-transmitted helminths are a serious but understudied health concern in South Africa, requiring immediate attention from the scientific community. [v2; ref status: approved 1, approved with reservations 1, http://f1000r.es/4dc]

Hannah O Ajoge^{1,2}, Stephen O Olonitola³, David R Smith²

¹South African National Bioinformatics Institute, University of Western Cape, Belville, 7535, South Africa ²Department of Biology, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, N6A 5B7, Canada ³Department of Microbiology, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria

V2 First published: 04 Sep 2014, 3:209 (doi: 10.12688/f1000research.4812.1) Latest published: 11 Sep 2014, 3:209 (doi: 10.12688/f1000research.4812.2)

Abstract

Parasitic roundworms and flatworms, defined broadly as helminths, are estimated to infect over 1 billion people worldwide, and are particularly prevalent in developing, resource-strained communities. The consequences of these infections are immense and wide reaching, resulting in massive reductions in local and global economic productivity and contributing to millions of deaths per year. Helminth diseases can also reduce vaccine efficacy and heighten morbidity rates of other serious illnesses, including tuberculosis and HIV/AIDS. Here, we argue that South Africa, which has one the highest rates of both HIV/AIDS and helminth infections on earth, needs to allocate more energy and resources into studying soil-transmitted helminths. Using PubMed and GenBank statistics, we show that the current South African research output on soil-transmitted helminths pales in comparison to that on HIV and tuberculosis. Basic research on helminth biology as well as on the social and environmental effects associated with infections could greatly reduce the burden of HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, and other major illnesses in South Africa and beyond. The onus is on scientists, funding agencies, and governing bodies to channel efforts into studies on soil-transmitted helminths.

Open Peer Review				
Referee Statu	s: 🥂 🗹			
	Invited Referees 1 2			
REVISED version 2 published 11 Sep 2014 version 1 published 04 Sep 2014	report	report		
 James Smith, University of Edinburgh UK Chikwe Ihekweazu, National Institute for Communicable Diseases South Africa 				
Discuss this a	rticle			

Comments (2)

Corresponding author: David R Smith (dsmit242@uwo.ca)

How to cite this article: Ajoge HO, Olonitola SO and Smith DR. Soil-transmitted helminths are a serious but understudied health concern in South Africa, requiring immediate attention from the scientific community. [v2; ref status: approved 1, approved with reservations 1, http://f1000r.es/4dc] *F1000Research* 2014, **3**:209 (doi: 10.12688/f1000research.4812.2)

Copyright: © 2014 Ajoge HO *et al.* This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Licence, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. Data associated with the article are available under the terms of the Creative Commons Zero "No rights reserved" data waiver (CC0 1.0 Public domain dedication).

Grant information: HOA was supported (2012–2013) by the South African National Research Foundation Innovation Post-doctoral fellowship. DRS is supported by a Discovery Grant to from the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada. *The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.*

Competing interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

First published: 04 Sep 2014, 3:209 (doi: 10.12688/f1000research.4812.1)

REVISED Amendments from Version 1

We have revised Table 1 to take into account the comment from Tali Cassidy, with regards to the data from the WHO PCT database. The data for soil-transmitted helminthiases are now correctly stated to represent the population of children (<15 years old) needing **preventative treatment** as of 2012 (previously 'number of children (<15 years old) **infected**').

See referee reports

Commentary

Over a billion people in sub-Saharan Africa and developing regions of Asia and the Americas have helminthiasis—a devastating category of diseases caused by parasitic worms (helminths)^{1–3}, such as roundworms (nematodes), tapeworms (cestodes), or flukes (trematodes). Parasitic helminths can infect the intestinal tract, urinary tract, and blood of humans, and other mammals, leading to serious illness and in some cases permanent disability or death. The most common types of helminthiasis are intestinal and caused by soil-transmitted roundworms, including *Ascaris lumbricoides* and *Trichuris trichiura*, and the hookworms *Necator americanus* and *Ancylostoma duodenale*^{3–6}. Schistosomiasis and lymphatic filariasis, commonly known as bilharzia and elephantiasis, respectively, are other less common kinds of helminthiases³.

Most people with helminthiasis live in marginalized, resourcelimited communities. Sadly, school-aged children and women of childbearing age, including adolescent girls, are among the most susceptible to chronic helminth infections and are at a greater risk of morbidity than members of other groups⁴. Because of its insidious, chronic nature, helminthiasis often goes untreated, leading to far-reaching social and economic consequences. Those infected with helminths show decreased performance at school and work and are predisposed to permanent disability, cardiovascular disease, and premature death. Helminthiases can also reduce vaccine efficacy and accentuate the morbidity rates of other serious diseases, such as malaria, tuberculosis, and HIV/AIDS^{3,7–9}. Indeed, a number of studies on African populations have shown that helminth infections increase morbidity rates in HIV/AIDS patients as a result of systemic immune activation^{8,10–12}.

Reducing the number of helminthiasis infections should, therefore, decrease disease burden and pressure on the health care system, especially in countries with high rates of HIV/AIDS. South Africa, which has the highest prevalence of HIV in the world and the highest rate of HIV-associated tuberculosis has channeled significant resources into fighting both of these diseases, but devotes comparatively little money and effort into combating helminthiasis^{13,14}. Moreover, of the estimated 6.1 million people living with HIV in South Africa as of 2012, 0.41 million were under the age of 15 (http://www.unaids.org/en/regionscountries/countries/southafrica/), and are, thus, highly susceptible to helminth infections.

Mass drug administration (MDA) programs, involving cooperation between government health departments and major pharmaceutical companies, provide low-cost or free drugs for the treatment of various diseases and are one of the most cost-effective global public health control measures in existence⁵. Moreover, many of the MDA programs are targeted at preschool- and school-aged children; however, children who do not attend school can be overlooked¹. Currently, a major obstacle to implementing cost-effective controls for helminthiasis is the lack of knowledge on the geographical distribution of infection and co-infection^{3,15} — a problem that could be easily and quickly solved with some basic research initiatives into helminthiasis. Again, given recent evidence of helminths developing drug resistance^{1,16}, an alternative to MDA becomes a necessity. Vaccine (which doesn't presently exist) research and development may thus be the best long-term strategy for sustained control and treatment of helminthic infections^{5,17}.

To gauge South African research output on HIV and tuberculosis versus that on soil-transmitted helminths, we explored PubMed publication numbers and GenBank deposition data (Table 1). In the

Table 1. Statistics on the prevalence, publication rate, and number of genetic sequences for HIV, tuberculosis, and soil-transmitted helminths in South Africa.

	HIV	Mycobacterium tuberculosis	Soil-transmitted helminthiases (STH)
Population of children (<15 years old) infected (HIV) or needing preventative treatment (STH) as of 2012	410,000ª	39,000 ^b	3,200,000°
Publications available in PubMed (July 2013 to June 2014) ^d	447	74	3
Numbers of above that are lead-authored by researchers in South African institutions ^d	394	66	2
Nucleotide sequences available in NCBI ^d	3,225	22,175	0

^ahttp://www.unaids.org/en/regionscountries/countries/southafrica/

^bhttp://www.who.int/tb/country/data/profiles/en/

°http://www.who.int/neglected_diseases/preventive_chemotherapy/databank/en/index.html

"Statistics based on keyword searches in PubMed and GenBank using "HIV", "Mycobacterium tuberculosis", "Ascaris lumbricoides", "Trichuris trichiura", "Necator americanus", and "Ancylostoma duodenale." In addition to "South Africa", each keyword was used to retrieve data (using the 'Advanced Search Builder' option) from the respective databases. For PubMed search, "2013/07/01 to 2014/06/30" was indicated as the Publication date. Search results were edited manually to remove incorrect entries. The incorrect entries were mostly articles that matched the main search terms but were from other African countries.

past year (July 2013 to June 2014), more than 400 journal articles have been published on HIV in South Africa, most of which have at least one author who is affiliated with a South African research institute. These journal articles cut across diverse HIV research areas, including diagnosis, treatment, vaccine trials, co-infections, mother-to-child transmission, and drug resistance. In comparison, there are very few published studies on soil-transmitted helminths in South Africa (mainly in Western Cape and Kwazulu-Natal). Within the past twelve months, only three journal articles on soiltransmitted helminths in South Africa appeared in PubMed, one of which was lead-authored by a researcher from a Cameroonian institute¹⁸⁻²⁰ (Table 1). What's more, there are thousands of HIV genome sequences from South Africans deposited in GenBank but not a single nucleotide sequence exists from a South African soiltransmitted helminth (Table 1). Given these statistics it appears that there is an overall lack of research on helminthiasis, both within and outside of South Africa.

The onus is on scientists, funding agencies, and governing bodies to channel efforts into studies on soil-transmitted helminths. Basic research on helminth evolution, cell biology, genetics, and diversity as well as on the social and environmental effects associated with infections could greatly reduce the burden of HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, and other major illnesses in South Africa and beyond. Helminth research also represents the first logical step in achieving the 2013 World Health Assembly (WHA) resolution to eliminate soil-transmitted helminths by $2020^{1,3}$.

Author contributions

HOA and SOO conceived the study. HOA and DRS prepared the first draft of the manuscript. All authors were involved in the revision of the draft manuscript and have agreed to the final content.

Competing interests

No competing interests were disclosed.

Grant information

HOA was supported (2012-2013) by the South African National Research Foundation Innovation Post-doctoral fellowship. DRS is supported by a Discovery Grant to from the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada.

The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

Acknowledgments

We thank Anirban Banerjee for careful reading and helpful feedback on the manuscript.

References

- 1. Barry MA, Simon GG, Mistry N, et al.: Global trends in neglected tropical disease control and elimination: impact on child health. Arch Dis Child. 2013; 98(8): 635–641. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Gazzinelli A, Correa-Oliveira R, Yang GJ, et al.: A research agenda for helminth 2. diseases of humans: social ecology, environmental determinants, and health systems. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2012; 6(4): e1603. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Lustigman S, Prichard RK, Gazzinelli A, et al.: A research agenda for helminth З. diseases of humans: the problem of helminthiases. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2012; 6(4): e1582 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Brooker S, Kabatereine NB, Smith JL, et al.: An updated atlas of human helminth 4. infections: the example of East Africa. Int J Health Geogr. 2009; 8: 42. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Prichard RK, Basanez MG, Boatin BA, et al.: A research agenda for helminth diseases of humans: intervention for control and elimination. PLoS Neal Trop Dis. 2012; 6(4); e1549. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- 6. Tchuem Tchuente LA: Control of soil-transmitted helminths in sub-Saharan Africa: diagnosis, drug efficacy concerns and challenges. Acta Trop. 2011; 120(Suppl 1): S4-11 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Fincham JE, Markus MB, Adams VJ: Could control of soil-transmitted helminthic 7. infection influence the HIV/AIDS pandemic. Acta Trop. 2003; 86(2-3): 315-333. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Chachage M, Podola L, Clowes P, et al.: Helminth-associated systemic immune 8 activation and HIV co-receptor expression: response to albendazole/ praziquantel treatment. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2014; 8(3): e2755. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Moolani Y, Bukhman G, Hotez PJ: Neglected tropical diseases as hidden causes of cardiovascular disease. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2012; 6(6): e1499 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Kalinkovich A, Borkow G, Weisman Z, et al.: Increased CCR5 and CXCR4 expression in Ethiopians living in Israel: environmental and constitutive factors. Clin Immunol. 2001; 100(1): 107-117. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- 11. Kalinkovich A, Weisman Z, Greenberg Z, et al.: Decreased CD4 and increased

CD8 counts with T cell activation is associated with chronic helminth infection. Clin Exp Immunol, 1998; 114(3); 414-421. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

- Secor WE, Shah A, Mwinzi PM, et al.: Increased density of human immunodeficiency 12. virus type 1 coreceptors CCR5 and CXCR4 on the surfaces of CD4(+) T cells and monocytes of patients with Schistosoma mansoni infection. Infect Immun. 2003; 71(11): 6668-6671. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
 - Churchyard GJ, Mametja LD, Mvusi L, et al.: Tuberculosis control in South Africa:
- 13. successes, challenges and recommendations. S Afr Med J. 2014; 104(3 Suppl 1): 244-248 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Simelela NP, Venter WD: A brief history of South Africa's response to AIDS. 14. S Afr Med J. 2014; 104(3 Suppl 1): 249-251. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Brooker S, Clements AC, Bundy DA: Global epidemiology, ecology and control of 15. soil-transmitted helminth infections. Adv Parasitol. 2006; 62: 221-261. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- 16. Cantacessi C, Hofmann A, Pickering D, et al.: TIMPs of parasitic helminths - a large-scale analysis of high-throughput sequence datasets. Parasit Vectors. 2013 6 156 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Research priorities for helminth infections. World Health Organ Tech Rep Ser. 17. 2012; (972):xv-xvii, 1-174, back cover
- **PubMed Abstract** Sumbele IU, Ngole VM, Ekosse GI: Influence of physico-chemistry and 18. mineralogy on the occurrence of geohelminths in geophagic soils from selected communities in the Eastern Cape, South Africa, and their possible implication on human health. Int J Environ Health Res. 2014; 24(1): 18-30. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Kvalsvig J, Albonico M: Effects of geohelminth infections on neurological 19. development. Handb Clin Neurol. 2013; 114: 369-379. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Nxasana N, Baba K, Bhat V, et al.: Prevalence of intestinal parasites in primary 20. school children of mthatha, eastern cape province, South Africa. Ann Mea Health Sci Res. 2013; 3(4): 511-516 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Open Peer Review

Current Referee Status:

? 🗹

Version 2

Referee Report 09 March 2015

doi:10.5256/f1000research.5664.r7877

Chikwe Ihekweazu

National Institute for Communicable Diseases, Johannesburgh, South Africa

This article makes an important case and raises important issues. However, I am not sure how much children out of school is a challenge in South Africa. Also - I think the authors should have acknowledged the incredibly difficult challenge of prioritization of resource allocation. Otherwise - I would approve this for indexing.

I have read this submission. I believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Referee Report 08 October 2014

doi:10.5256/f1000research.5664.r6286



James Smith

School of Social and Political Science, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK

The article makes a reasonable point around the thorny issue of research prioritisation - although I think conflating actual numbers of child HIV infections with children at risk of infection of STH is not an ideal comparison given relative differences in disease burden. Ideally, the bibliographic data would be supplemented with direct insights into how and why research is prioritised (by all parties) in a South African context as the data itself, while initially striking, does not provide any great insight into this.

I do not think the publishing results are surprising for many reasons - funding, research interest, building of a critical mass of research in areas of HIV research, need for new HIV tools, MDA relatively effective for STH etc. Given South Africa's slow response to its HIV crisis, in particular, it is not surprising so much research is devoted to HIV. I think, that being the case, and the fact that this is an opinion article that the authors might have lengthened their discussion and reflected on the relative evidence/impact of the three diseases (few would argue that HIV or TB is a bigger societal burden, but perhaps the data/analytics we use to assess disease burden is flawed or skewed towards certain measures of burden?) There is a large literature on this and other issues regarding prioritisation (DALYs etc), in relation to NTDs, that ought to be referenced.

Furthermore, the interactions between funders, scientists and funding bodies are complex and systemic and it is overly simplistic to lay the onus on the research ecosystem to prioritise other diseases (there are also many reasons for inertia in research re-orientation). One needs to reflect on how to lever and incentivise the system if one wants different priorities supported, and to reflect on the data that unpins that sort of decision making. It would be useful for the authors to elaborate their argument here, which would involve having a deeper sense of the politics and practices of the STH (and broader) research community in South Africa.

Finally, while quite clearly not much research is going on with regards to STH in South Africa the authors do not really provide evidence that research should be re-prioritised. MDA coverage - which happens in South Africa - means that the disease burden is relatively low, whereas HIV and TB (to a lesser extent) remain extraordinarily high. Few would argue that research should not be focused on HIV, at issue might be the extent to which it is. It would have strengthened the authors' case to have cited policy/opinion from the NRF, Dept of Health etc that indicates that soil-tranmitted helminths are a problem that requires more research activity, and suggests obvious areas where research is lacking.

Ultimately the paper raises an interesting point about research and health priorities in a relatively resource constrained context but does not extend far enough beyond that by reflecting on the nature of evidence, exploring why helminth research is not better supported, and reflecting on how actually to lever more research if indeed it is truly necessary. If the authors were to focus on tracing precisely why so little soil-transmitted helminth research goes on (by for example interviewing the small number of people who do work on the diseases as well as key actors like the NRF) there may well be an interesting full length article to be written about science and health policy in South Africa.

I have read this submission. I believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Discuss this Article

Version 1

Author Response 10 Sep 2014

David Smith, University of Western Ontario, Canada

We have revised Table 1 to take into account the comment from Tali Smith, with regards to the data from the WHO PCT database. The data for soil-transmitted helminthiases are now correctly stated to represent the population of children (<15 years old) needing **preventative treatment** as of 2012 (previously 'number of children (<15 years old) **infected**').

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reader Comment 09 Sep 2014

Tali Cassidy, Boston University School of Public Health, South Africa

The prevalence of STHs in the table presented above is incorrect. It refers to the WHO PCT database, which give the figure of children AT RISK for STHs. i.e. those that should get preventive treatment, not those infected.

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.